

Evaluation Of Implementation Procurement Policies Via E-Catalog for Construction Work (Case Study: National Road Implementation Agency For West Sumatera Region)

Eko Purwono¹, Taufika Ophyandri², Benny Hidayat³

^{1,2,3} Civil Engineering, Universitas Andalas, Indonesia

*Corresponding author, e-mail: ekopurwono002@gmail.com

Received 23th August 2024; Revision 21th August 2024; Accepted 25th September 2024

ABSTRACT

National Road Implementation Agency (BPJN) for West Sumatera Region has an important role in managing road infrastructure in the West Sumatra Province. In the context of procurement for construction implemented by BPJN for West Sumatra, the use of e-catalogs is a solution to simplify the procurement process. The aim of this research is to evaluate how it is implemented, analyze supporting factors, analyze weaknesses and evaluate the benefits of the policy of procurement via e-catalog in construction work. This research uses a qualitative approach with a semi-structured interview method and Data analysis used thematic analysis. The results of the research show that the implementation of the policy for procurement via e-catalog for construction work at the National Road Implementation Agency for West Sumatera Region has been successfully carried out without any significant problems. Implementation of the policy for procurement via e-catalog in construction work is influenced by various supporting factors, including ease of application, socialization and technical guidance, adequate infrastructure, staff competence and coordination, as well as clear regulations and guidelines. Weaknesses of e-catalogs such as no information on remaining package capabilities, main equipment having to be proprietary, provider selection opportunities, limited service locations, and complete product limitations, all have a significant impact on the effectiveness and efficiency of the procurement process. The E-catalog system provides various significant benefits for construction work. Procurement time efficiency, fair prices, transparent systems, price negotiation, work outcomes, bid documents, provider selection, as well as motivation and competitiveness are some of the key benefits identified.

Keywords: *Implementation; Procurement; E-Catalog.*

Copyright © Eko Purwono, Taufika Ophyandri, Benny Hidayat

This is an open-access article under the: <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>

INTRODUCTION

Use of information technology, including the use of the e-catalog system, to increase transparency, efficiency, and accountability in the procurement [1]. This regulation is the basis for organizing e-catalogs for the procurement in government agencies. The e-catalog is organized by LKPP with the aim of realizing the creation of a direct selection process for Procurement, so that all Procurement Service Units (ULP) or Procurement Officers can choose goods and services from the best choices, as well as cost and time efficiency in the selection process for goods and services from the side of goods and service providers and users.

National Road Implementation Agency (BPJN) for West Sumatera Region has an important role in managing road infrastructure in the West Sumatra Province. Implementation

Procurement Policies Via E-Catalog For Construction Work in BPJN of West Sumatra is a new policy that will be implemented in 2023. This policy should make the interaction process between users and service providers, as well as the community easier and speed up the procurement process. In addition, the e-catalog implementation policy is expected to automatically improve the control system against various deviations and violations of existing rules.

However, the problem of policy implementation is related to development and based on the experiences of developing countries, there are many things that show factors from simple to complex factors such as the problem of the availability of organizational structure resources or problems related to working relationships between organizations and others. In reality, such factors can affect development programs, whether they result in success or failure in achieving planned public policies [2].

The importance of policy implementation as a factor to study in depth the determination of public policies to lead to success as the goals to be achieved. In addition, by evaluating policy implementation, this study will also examine the weaknesses of a policy with the hypothesis that every policy must have weaknesses. Based on the description, this research was raised with the title "Evaluation Of Implementation Procurement Policies Via E-Catalog For Construction Work (Case Study: National Road Implementation Agency For West Sumatera Region)".

METHOD

Theoretically, the research approach used in this research is qualitative research. Research methods based on the philosophy of postpositivism, used to research the conditions of natural objects, (as opposed to experiments) where the researcher is the key instrument, data collection techniques are carried out triangulation (combined), Data analysis is inductive or qualitative and the results of qualitative research emphasize meaning rather than generalization [3].

Data collection was carried out by interviewing respondents with the aim of obtaining information directly, being able to obtain correct data and complementary data that will support this research. Respondents were selected in this research purposively.

Sampling for this research used a sampling technique. The sampling technique used is purposive sampling, which is sampling by determining certain criteria [3]. Purposive sampling aims to produce a sample that can logically be considered representative of the population. The sample of respondents in this study was 18 respondents as follows:

Table 1. Research Respondents

No	Institution Name	Company Type	Department	Respondent Code	Respondent (People)
1.	National Road Implementation Agency For West Sumatera Region	Owner	PPK	PPK 1.1, PPK12, PPK 1.4, PPK1.5	4
2.	National Road Implementation Agency For West Sumatera Region	Owner	Kaur	Kaur 1, Kaur 2, Kaur 3, Kaur 4, Kaur 5	5
3.	Contractor	Contractor 1 to contractor 9	Technical Staff/Similar	K1, K2, K3, K4, K5, K6, K7, K8, K9	9

The samples used were respondents who met the criteria of having work experience on

construction jobs using the e-catalog system in 2023. Interviews were conducted by asking respondents pre-prepared questions and were conducted in May and June located in West Sumatra. Based on the research objectives, the first research objective is related to policy implementation, this research will use 9 respondents from the owner (PPK and Kaur) because the essence of implementation is distributing policy output from the implementer to the target group [4]. So, this research uses implementers (PPK and Kaur) as respondents. Meanwhile, for the second, third and fourth research objectives, this research used 18 respondents consisting of 9 owners and 9 contractors.

The data analysis technique used in this research is Thematic analysis. Thematic analysis is one way to analyze data with the aim of identifying patterns or finding themes through data that has been collected by researchers [5]. This method is a very effective method if a study intends to examine in detail the qualitative data they have in order to find interrelated patterns in a phenomenon and explain the extent to which a phenomenon occurs through the researcher's eyes [6].

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

A. Evaluation of implementation procurement policies via e-catalog for construction work

In evaluating the implementation of procurement policies via e-catalogs for construction work at the National Road Implementation Agency For West Sumatra Region, this research is guided by the theory of policy implementation adopted by George C. Edwar III. In this policy model, Edward III put forward several things that could influence the success of implementation, namely: (1) Communication, (2) Resources, (3) Disposition), (4) Bureaucratic Structure [7]:

1. Communication

Implementation of a policy will be effective if the implementer knows and understands everything that is the responsibility and objectives of the policy. The results of the interview can be seen in table 2 as follows:

Table 2. Thematic Analisis About Communication

No.	Thema	Code	Respondent
1.	Structured socialization: There is a socialization process carried out systematically by various parties.	Socialization by various parties	PPK 1.1, PPK 1.2
		Tiered communication	PPK 1.4
2.	Formal and informal communication: Use of various official and unofficial communication media.	Online Communication	Kaur 1
		External communications	Kaur 2
		Formal communication	Kaur 3
3.	Technical support: Training and technical assistance provided to staff and all stakeholders.	Technical Guidance	PPK 1.1, PPK 1.5, Kaur 5, Kaur 4

Based on table 2, it shows that the procurement policy via e-catalog for construction work has been communicated to all interested parties through various channels and methods. With clear, precise and continuous communication, all parties involved can understand the procedures and requirements well, which will ultimately increase the effectiveness and

efficiency of the procurement process. For policies to be implemented effectively, communication between policy makers and implementers must be clear, consistent and continuous. Without effective communication, policies may not be properly understood by implementers, which can hinder the implementation process [7].

2. Resource

Elements that must be considered in resources are staff, information, authority and facilities. The results of interviews from resources are as follows:

Table 3. Thematic Analisis About Resources

No	Thema	Code	Respondent
A. Staff			
1.	Ease of use of the application: The e-catalogue application is designed with high ease of use, so staff can master it quickly.	Easy application	PPK 1.2
2.	Training and socialization: Training and outreach are important factors in ensuring staff have sufficient understanding of the e-catalog. These trainings are designed to equip staff with the knowledge necessary to run an e-catalog.	Training	PPK 1.1, PPK 1.5, Kaur 5
		Socialization	PPK 1.4
3.	Staff skills and competencies: Staff competency and skills are considered sufficient to implement procurement policies via e-catalog. This includes shared learning among staff and guidance from the KDP that ensures effective implementation.	Skills and competencies	Kaur 1, Kaur 2, Kaur 3, Kaur 4
B. Information			
4.	Providing information: This theme highlights the efforts made to provide staff with complete information about their duties through various channels such as outreach, training, and existing regulations.	Various information media channels	PPK 1.1, PPK 1.2 PPK 1.4, PPK 1.5, Kaur 2, Kaur 5,
5.	Online or offline training: This theme shows the importance of additional training and direction provided via zoom meetings to ensure staff have adequate knowledge in implementing procurement policies via e-catalog.	Online training	Kaur 1, Kaur 3
		Offline Training	Kaur 4:
C. Authority			
6.	The role of PPK in e-catalogs: This theme highlights the main role of PPK in procurement policy through e-catalogs, including in managing the procurement process/supplier selection, and evaluation and implementation. This role ensures that the program can be directed as expected.	The authority is PPK	PPK 1.1, PPK 1.2, PPK 1.4, PPK 1.5, Kaur 1, Kaur 2, Kaur 3, Kaur 4, Kaur 5
D. Facility			
7.	Server and network quality: This theme shows the good quality of servers and networks used in electronic procurement services, from sometimes down to good	The server is down and the network depends on the provider	PPK 1.2:

No	Thema	Code	Respondent
		Good server and network quality	PPK 1.5, Kaur 5 PPK 1.4, Kaur 2
		Constraints when all access	Kaur 4, Kaur 3
8.	E-catalog still running: This theme reflects how the e-catalog continues to run even though there have been problems with servers and networks so that these obstacles are not a significant obstacle.	The E catalog continues to run without significant problems	PPK 1.1, Kaur 1

Based on table 3, it shows that the resources in the procurement policy via e-catalog for construction work are concluded to be good and supportive. This can be seen in staff who already have a comprehensive understanding and adequate skills in implementing procurement policies via e-catalog, staff involved in procurement policies via e-catalog have been provided with sufficient information about their duties through various channels, including socialization, regulations, and additional training, the existence of authority that ensures the program can be directed as expected and that facilities are generally still running smoothly without significant obstacles. Without sufficient resources, be they financial, human, or technological, policies cannot be implemented effectively. Adequate resources ensure that all operational aspects can run according to plans and policy objectives can be achieved [7].

3. Disposition

One of the factors that influences the effectiveness of policy implementation is the attitude of the implementer such as commitment, accuracy of position, and high motivation in working. There are things that must be considered about this variable, such as disposition effects, bureaucratic arrangements and incentives. The results of the interview can be seen in table 4 as follows:

Table 4. Thematic Analisis About Disposition

No	Thema	Code	Respondent
A. Disposition Effect			
1.	High stakeholder commitment: High level of dedication and good involvement of all stakeholders in carrying out their duties.	Commitment	PPK 1.2, PPK 1.5, Kaur 5, Kaur 1, Kaur 3, Kaur 4
2.	Compliance with rules: Stakeholder compliance with rules and regulations related to e-catalogs.	Implement according to the applicable rules	PPK 1.1, Kaur 2
3.	Smooth execution: The procurement policy via e-catalog that runs smoothly proves that all staff work well in carrying out their duties.	Smooth e-catalog implementation	PPK 1.4
B. Carrying out Bureaucratic Arrangements			
4.	Ability according to field: Alignment of staff abilities with the field they occupy.	Ability according to field	PPK 1.1, PPK 1.4 Kaur 1, Kaur 3

No	Thema	Code	Respondent
5.	Training and information: Training and information provided to staff to implement procurement policies through e-catalogs.	Training and Information	Kaur 2, Kaur 4
6.	Abilities vary and activities are no problem: Variations in staff capabilities regarding areas of academic expertise.	Capabilities vary	PPK 1.2
		E-catalog is running smoothly	PPK 1.5, Kaur 5
C. Incentives			
7.	Salary according to the rules: Receipt of salary in accordance with the applicable rules and regulations.	There are no incentives and salaries according to regulations	PPK 1.2, PPK 1.4 PPK 1.5, Kaur 5, Kaur 1, Kaur 2, Kaur 4
8.	Staff continue to carry out their duties well: Staff commitment in carrying out tasks even without additional incentives.	Perform tasks	PPK 1.1, Kaur 3

Based on table 4, it shows that the disposition in the procurement policy via e-catalog for construction work at BPJN West Sumatra has been carried out according to the regulations. Dispositions such as staff have high commitment so that there is no disposition effect, staff have been placed in positions according to their area of ability, and incentives are not a benchmark in working. The implementer's attitude towards a policy greatly determines whether the policy will be implemented well or not [8].

4. Bureaucratic Structure

Complex policies require good cooperation between the policy actors involved. There is a Standard Operating Procedure (SOP) which serves as a guideline for each implementer in acting and working together. Carrying out segmentation also makes it possible for staff to carry out the tasks of other staff in the same field. The results of the interview can be seen in table 5 below:

Table 4. Thematic Analisis About Bureaucratic Structure

No.	Thema	Code	Respondent
1.	Collaboration and staff replacement: Collaboration and staff replacement are key strategies to ensure the smooth running of tasks. Other staff can fill in if someone is unable to attend, and communication and backup systems are always in place to deal with staff absences.	Collaboration and staff replacement	PPK 1.1, PPK 1.1, Kaur 1, Kaur 3, Kaur 4
2.	Training and coaching: Training and guidance are important steps in ensuring that staff have adequate skills. PPK provides direction and guidance, and additional training is provided if there are obstacles or lack of ability	Training	Kaur 2
3.	Existence of SOPs: The SOPs regulated internally at PUPR provide clear guidelines for carrying out tasks, ensuring that the e-catalog procurement process runs in accordance with established standards.	There are SOPs	PPK 1.4, PPK 1.5, Kaur 5

The thematic analysis of table 5 shows that the bureaucratic structure in implementing procurement policies through e-catalogs is supported by existing SOPs as well as various alternative steps that are implemented when staff experience obstacles. In conclusion, with collaboration, staff replacement, training and clear SOPs, organizations can ensure that the implementation of procurement policies through e-catalogs continues smoothly even if staff experience obstacles or are unable to carry out their duties.

B. Analysis of Supporting Factors for Policy Implementation via e-catalog for construction work

Implementation of a policy will be successful if there are supporting factors in implementing the policy. The results of the interview can be seen in table 6 as follows:

Table 6. Thematic Analisis About Supporting Factors

No.	Thema	Code	Respondent
1.	Ease of application: An easy-to-use application clearly helps speed up and simplify the e-catalog process.	Ease of application	PPK 1.2
		There are SOPs	Q5:
2.	Socialization and technical guidance (Bimtek): Technical guidance and socialization are important factors in increasing staff understanding and skills.	Socialization and technical guidance	PPK 1.2, PPK 1.5, Kaur 5, Kaur 1, Kaur 2, Kaur 3, Kaur 4, K1, K2, K3, K4, K6, K7, K8, K9
3.	Infrastructure and facilities: Infrastruktur such as internet networks, servers and computer devices.	Computer equipment	PPK 1.1, PPK 1.4 Kaur 3
		Good network and server	PPK 1.2, K4
		Supporting facilities	K8
4.	Staff competency and coordination: Good staff competence and coordination ensure effective implementation.	Competence and Coordination	PPK 1.1, PPK 1.4 K4
5.	Regulations and guidelines: There are clear regulations and guidelines as a reference in implementing e-catalogs.	Guidelines	PPK 1.5, Kaur 5, K5, Kaur 3
		Rules	Kaur 1, K8, K4

The thematic analysis in table 6 shows that several main factors support the implementation of procurement policies through e-catalogs. The following are the supporting factors found such as: Ease of application; Technical training and guidance (Bimtek); Infrastructure and facilities; Staff competency and coordination; Regulations and guidelines:

C. Analysis of Weaknesses in Implementing Procurement Policies Via E-Catalog Compared with Tender Systems for Construction Work

In implementing a policy, there are certainly weaknesses that need attention. The results of the interview can be seen in table 7 as follows:

Table 7. Thematic Analisis About Weaknesses of the E-catalog System

No.	Thema	Code	Respondent
1.	No SKP information: The absence of information regarding Remaining Capability Packages (SKP) means that service users cannot get an idea of how many service provider projects are ongoing/active. So service users cannot measure the limits of the package capabilities that can be handled by the prospective service provider they choose.	There is no SKP	PPK 1.2, Kaur 4, K5, K8
2.	The main equipment must be proprietary: There is a technical requirement that there must be proof of ownership of the main equipment for each work item, such as the Asphalt Mixing Plant (AMP) for flexible pavement work, the Asphalt Slurry Seal Truck for preventive work and the Batcing Plant for rigid pavement repair work.	Complete equipment	PPK 1.2 K3
3.	Provider selection opportunities: Small and inexperienced contractors will find it difficult to compete because the contractor's competence and infrastructure are incomplete and PPK tends to choose experienced ones because they are more likely to provide assurances of accurate quality and punctuality based on track record.	Limited choice of partners	PPK 1.2
		Selection tends to be experienced	PPK 1.4, K5, K6, K7, K9
4.	Service location limitations: There are restrictions on service providers based on service location so that providers located outside the service location cannot be selected.	Work area/sectoral	PPK 1.2
5.	Complete product (item) product limitations: There are still many service providers who have not entered complete bidder data/items. Work items should be offered in the window so that whatever product/item the service user needs is available in the window.	The work item is not in the display case	PPK 1.1
		The provider has not yet entered the e-catalog system	PPK 1.5, Kaur 5
		Contractors do not enter enough data	Kaur 3
		Contractors who complete items are few	K5

Based on the thematic analysis in table 7 relating to the weaknesses of procurement policies via e-catalog for construction work at BPJN West Sumatra, a comparison matrix can be made between the e-catalog system and the tender system which can be seen from table 8 as follows:

Table 8. Comparison Matrix of Weaknesses of E-catalog System with Tender

No.	Description	E-katalog	Tender
1.	Limited SKP information	There is no information regarding SKP	SKP information is there is an offer
2.	Equipment must be proprietary	There is a technical requirement that there must be proof of ownership of main equipment such as the Asphalt Mixing Plant (AMP) for flexible pavement	More flexible terms, including equipment rental.

No.	Description	E-katalog	Tender
		work, the Asphalt Slurry Seal Truck for preventive work and the Batcing Plant for rigid pavement repair work.	
3.	Provider selection opportunities	Small providers and inexperienced providers will find it difficult to gain trust	The chances of being selected depend on the offer
4.	Service location limitations	Sectoral applies, limited by service location, cannot choose providers from outside the area/outside the service location.	Can be non-sectoral, not limited by service location
5.	Complete product (item) product limitations	There are still many service providers who have not entered the complete product/item offering.	Data (items) can be completed immediately during the bidding period

Based on the matrix in table 8, it can be concluded that there are 5 descriptions of the weaknesses of the e-catalog system compared to the tender system for construction work, such as: limited SKP information, main equipment must be proprietary, small opportunity for selecting a provider for small and inexperienced contractors, limitations service location, limitations of complete product (item) offerings. This comparison matrix shows the weaknesses of e-catalogs in various aspects compared to conventional tender systems.

D. Evaluation of the Benefits of Implementing Procurement Policies Through E-Catalog compared to the Tender System for Construction Work

Every policy certainly has beneficial implications for its implementation. The results of the interview can be seen in table 9 as follows:

Table 9. Thematic Analisis About the Benefits of the E-catalog System

No.	Thema	Code	Respondent
1.	Procurement time efficiency The procurement process is faster than tenders	Procurement time efficiency	PPK 1.2, PPK 1.5, Kaur 5, Kaur 2, Kaur 4, Kaur 1, Kaur 3, K1, K2, K3, K4, K5, K6, K8, K9
2.	Reasonable price: The prices displayed in the e-catalog are the best and fair prices, unlike tenders where there is a possibility of offering prices below 80 percent.	Best and reasonable price	PPK 1.1, PPK 1.2, Kaur 3, K2, K3, K4, K6
3.	Transparent system: A system that allows more open and transparent access to information such as open prices per item (product).	Transparent	PPK 1.5, Kaur 5 Kaur 3, K4, K5, K8, K9
4.	Price negotiation: There is price negotiation by PPK with providers so that the best price is obtained.	Negotiations by PPK	PPK 1.2, Kaur 4, K5, K8
5.	Results of work: Guarantee better work results in terms of time and quality	Better work results	PPK 1.1, PPK 1.2 PPK 1.4, Kaur 1, K1, K4, K6, K7, K8
6.	Offer documents:	Happens continuously	K5

No.	Thema	Code	Respondent
	The displayed offer document (product) can be used for more than 1 package (valid continuously until product update)		
7.	Provider selection: The selection of service providers is carried out by the PP/PPK team	Selection by the PPK team	PPK 1.2, Kaur 4 K4, K6
8.	Motivation and competitiveness: Increase motivation and competitiveness between service providers. So that service providers who are currently working will do the best possible work both in terms of quality and time so that they are selected again in the next e-catalog system.	Increase motivation and competitiveness	PPK 1.2, K2, K7

Based on thematic analysis 9 relating to the benefits of procurement policies via e-catalog for construction work at BPJN West Sumatra, a comparison matrix can be created between the e-catalog system and the tender system which can be seen from table 10 as follows:

Table 10. Comparison Matrix of Benefits of E-catalog System with Tender

No.	Description	E-katalog	Tender
1.	Procurement time efficiency	Faster (\leq 1 week)	Longer (30 days or more)
2.	Reasonable price	Reasonable price and best price	It is possible that the price is below 80% which is not reasonable
3.	Transparent system	Be transparent with the prices listed	Transparent but there is no detailed price per item.
4.	Price negotiation	There was price negotiation by PPK	No price negotiation
5.	Results of work	Better work results due to the best prices	It is possible that the work results will not be good because the price is below 80% which is not reasonable
6.	Offer document	More than 1 package (Continuous)	Only for 1 package
7.	Provider selection	PP/PPK Team	Working Group Team
8.	Motivation and competitiveness	Increase the motivation and competitiveness of contractors to be re-elected	Lack of increasing contractor competitiveness

Based on table 10, it can be concluded that e-catalog has several main benefits compared to conventional tenders such as faster procurement time, the price offered is the best price, a more transparent system, there is price negotiation by the PPK, better work results, bid documents can be used for more than 1 package, provider selection by the PP/PPK team, and increases contractor motivation and competitiveness. The comparison matrix clarifies these advantages, highlighting how e-catalogs can be a more effective option in the procurement process.

CONCLUSION

The conclusions from this research are:

1. The implementation of procurement policies via e-catalog for construction work at the National Road Implementation Agency For West Sumatera Region has been successfully carried out without any significant problems, this can be seen from good communication, supporting resources, the disposition or attitude of the implementers carried out in accordance with the regulations. and a bureaucratic structure that has been implemented well.
2. Implementation of procurement policies via e-catalog in construction work is influenced by various supporting factors, including ease of application, socialization and technical guidance, adequate infrastructure, staff competence and coordination, as well as clear regulations and guidelines. These factors collectively ensure that the e-catalog system can function optimally, increasing procurement efficiency and effectiveness.
3. The implementation of procurement policies via e-catalog compared to the tender system for construction work has many weaknesses that need to be corrected. Weaknesses such as no information on remaining package capabilities, major equipment having to be proprietary, provider selection opportunities, limited service locations, and complete product limitations, all have a significant impact on the effectiveness and efficiency of the procurement process. Implementation of the e-catalog should increase transparency, efficiency and accessibility in the procurement process. However, the identified weaknesses indicate that there are still obstacles that need to be overcome to achieve this goal.
4. Evaluation of the benefits of procurement policies via e-catalog compared to the tender system shows that this system provides various significant benefits for construction work. Procurement time efficiency, fair prices, transparent systems, price negotiation, work outcomes, bid documents, selection of providers, as well as motivation and competitiveness are some of the main benefits identified. By continuously improving and optimizing the e-catalog system, these benefits can be further enhanced, making a greater contribution to the success of construction projects.

REFERENCE

- [1] RI Presidential Regulation Number 12 of 2021 concerning Amendments to Presidential Regulation Number 16 of 2018 concerning Procurement of Government Goods/Services.
- [2] Subianto, A. 2020. Public Policy Review of Planning, Implementation and Evaluation. Surabaya: Brilliant.
- [3] Sugiyono. 2019. Understanding Qualitative Research. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- [4] Erwah A.P and Dyah R.S. (2015). Public Policy Implementation: Concepts and Applications in Indonesia. Yogyakarta: Gava Media. xiv + 194 pp.
- [5] Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 3(2), p.77-101.
http://eprints.uwe.ac.uk/11735/2/thematic_analysis_revised_-_final.pdf [accessed 05 April 2024]

-
- [6] Fereday, J., & Muir-Cochrane, E. (2006). Demonstrating rigor using thematic analysis: A hybrid approach of inductive and deductive coding and theme development. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 5(1), 80-92.
- [7] Edwards III, G. C. (2008). *Implementation Public Policy*. 8th Revision. Washington: Congressional Quarterly Press.